

Presidential Task Force on the Under-Representation of Racialized and Indigenous Faculty and Staff

Report and Recommendations

CO-CHAIRS: DR. SARA DIAMOND AND DR. CAMILLE ISAACS

APRIL 2017



Table of Contents

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.....	1
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
TASK FORCE MANDATE AND CONTEXT	2
TASK FORCE MEMBERSHIP	4
METHODOLOGY	5
TASK FORCE CONSULTATION DATA	6
Faculty and Academic Leadership	6
University Staff and Non-Academic Leadership	6
RESPONSES FROM ON-LINE CONSULTATIONS, OPEN HOUSES, AND INFORMAL MEETINGS	7
EQUITY STATEMENT	9
RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLAN	10
CONCLUSION	13
WORKS CITED	14

Land Acknowledgement

OCAD University acknowledges the ancestral and traditional territories of the Mississaugas of the New Credit, the Haudenosaunee, the Anishinaabe and the Huron-Wendat, who are the original custodians of the land on which OCAD University operates.

Executive Summary

This document provides the mandate, context, analysis, recommendations and action plan of the Presidential Task Force on the Under-Representation of Racialized and Indigenous Faculty and Staff. The recommendations include an equity statement which lays out our university's commitment to equity and fourteen actions which are the results of extensive consultation and best practice analysis.

The goal of the action plan is an OCAD University in which the demographics of staff, faculty and administrators better represent the diverse students who make up our community and our international networks. The action plan will provide a work environment and culture which will foster equity, collaboration and result in a breadth of cultural knowledge and creative expression.

Task Force Mandate and Context

President Diamond established the mandate and membership of the task force in November 2015 in response to a negotiated settlement under the Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario (HRTO) between complainant Errol Saldanha and OCAD University. The mandate of the task force is to raise the percentage of racialized and Indigenous employees in all areas and at all levels of the University, and in doing so also seek to increase diversity in the curriculum. The President interpreted this mandate as pertaining to both hiring processes and retention. The task force would consult with university stakeholders, including students, faculty, sessional faculty, staff, managers and alumni, including Mr. Saldanha, and would develop a report with recommendations that would then form the basis of a University Action Plan. The President established a faculty co-chair, firstly Dr. Robert Diaz and then Dr. Camille Isaacs.

While prompted by the HRTO settlement, the task force is a welcome initiative in OCAD University's progress to become a more equitable and diverse institution, and its commitment to implementing the Truth and Reconciliation Commission's Calls to Action. The task force builds upon a decade of actions intended to improve representation, diversity and equity under the leadership of OCAD U's Office of Diversity, Equity and Sustainability Initiatives. In 2011, the University undertook a comprehensive survey of staff and faculty to

collect data on the representation of equity seeking groups as a part of an ongoing institutional employment equity program. In 2009, OCAD U launched an Indigenous Visual Culture (INVC) academic program and INVC Student Centre, and established an Aboriginal Educational Council in 2008. In 2007, the University appointed Canada's first Indigenous Chancellor, The Honourable James K. Bartleman. The task force also builds on successful achievements in the 1980's at OCAD U to address the under-representation of women in faculty and administration and significant gaps in pay between male and female employees (*Equity 2000*).

Presently, OCAD U is undertaking a review of its human rights policy, the *Respectful Work & Learning Environment Policy (RWLEP)*. These endeavors complement the world leading activities of the Inclusive Design Research Centre and Institute at OCAD U, in establishing standards, practices and technological innovations that support inclusion. The task force also coincides with a new institutional Vision and Mission, and Academic Plan, which emphasize decolonization, inclusion and equity.

We table this report at a significant moment in Canadian academia. Many institutions across the country are grappling with the under-representation of racialized and Indigenous faculty, staff, and students, and considering ways to redress historical inequity. This concern is reinforced by the number of recent publications, reports, and conversations happening in various settings. The CBC recently (January 2017) ran a news segment as part of their program, *The Current*, which considered the inequity in Canadian academia, particularly for Black graduate students. The forthcoming book, *The Equity Myth* (May 2017) by Frances Henry, et al., will be a comprehensive study of post-secondary equity programs nationwide and examine racism in Canadian universities.

Simultaneously, the publication of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada's Calls to Action specifically points to education, and post-secondary institutions, as a space for moving forward. Part of their calls to action are as follows:

- * "We call upon the federal government to develop with Aboriginal groups a joint strategy to eliminate educational and employment gaps between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Canadians"
- * "We call upon post-secondary institutions to create university and college degree and diploma programs in Aboriginal languages"
- * "We call upon the federal, provincial, and territorial governments... to ... provide the necessary funding to post-secondary institutions to educate teachers on how to integrate Indigenous knowledge and teaching methods into classrooms"

OCAD University recognizes the significance of this report to OCAD U's students, who do not yet see themselves adequately reflected in the faculty and staff complement with whom they come into daily contact. We also recognize the barriers faced by faculty and staff (current and prospective) to being hired, retained, and advanced to leadership positions. And we take this opportunity to highlight the obligations OCAD U has to deliver diverse curricula to its students, and thereby reflect the wider community.

To the 234 respondents who took the time to complete our surveys to help us to determine the barriers to hiring, retention, and advancement at both the faculty and staff levels, we want you to know that we heard you and we took your responses very seriously. The recommendations at the end of this report are a direct reflection of those survey responses.

Task Force Membership

Co-Chair, President and
Vice-Chancellor,

Dr. Sara Diamond

Co-Chair, Assistant Professor,
Faculty of Liberal Arts and
Sciences,

Dr. Camille Isaacs

Former Co-Chair, Assistant
Professor, Faculty of Liberal Arts
and Sciences,

Dr. Robert Diaz

Professor, Faculty of Art,

Dr. Richard Fung

Associate Professor, Faculty of Art,

Dr. Andrea Fatona

Associate Professor,
Faculty of Design,

Dr. Patricio Davila

Assistant Professor, Faculty of
Liberal Arts and Sciences,

Dr. Heather Coffey

Delaney Chair in Indigenous
Visual Culture,

Ryan Rice

Vice-President Academic
and Provost,

Dr. Gillian Siddall

Graduate Student
Representative,

Elisha Lim

Undergraduate Student
Representative,

Amanda Robertson-Hébert

OCADFA President,

Dr. Charles Reeve

OPSEU Representative,

Alvaro Araya

Manager, Campus Operations,

Lance Straun

Dean, Faculty of Art,

Dr. Vladimir Spicanovic

Director, Human Resources,

Nicky Davis

Director, Office of Diversity,
Equity & Sustainability Initiatives
(ODESI),

Amanda Hotrum

Programs, Outreach & Human
Rights Advisor, ODESI,

Shamina Chherawala

Methodology

The task force first started meeting in January of 2016, composed of faculty members from all 3 Faculties, academic leadership, administrative management, labour organizations (OPSEU and OCADFA), student representatives, the Delaney Chair in Indigenous Visual Culture, the Vice-President Academic & Provost, Human Resources, the Office of Diversity, Equity & Sustainability Initiatives, and the co-chairs, Dr. Sara Diamond and Dr. Camille Isaacs (previously Dr. Robert Diaz).

Under the leadership of Dr. Robert Diaz the task force developed the following methodology which drew on primarily qualitative social science methods:

- Develop an equity statement as a guiding framework for the task force
- Undertake a comprehensive survey of staff and faculty for feedback on the barriers to, and solutions for, hiring and retaining racialized and Indigenous staff and faculty. The survey was developed using social science methods and grounded in the Ontario Human Rights Commission's *A Policy Primer: Guide to Developing Human Rights Policies and Procedures*, which states that organizations should be aware of systemic barriers to under-represented groups and actively seek to remove them. The guide recognizes that barriers can be formal or informal in nature, and may include institutional practices around recruitment, selection, compensation, training, promotion and termination.
- Ensure privacy protection - all survey responses are secure and anonymous, held within ODESI and presented as aggregate data. No individual responses will be provided to OCAD University

faculty, staff or leadership.

- Organize consultation meetings with invited members of the community including Mr. Saldanha
- Hold office hours, open to all members of the OCAD U community, with Dr. Diaz, Dr. Isaacs and ODESI staff (as outlined in the settlement agreement) to provide feedback and recommendations.
- Crossover dialogues with the Academic Plan organizing committee to ensure that recommendations aligned with the academic plan
- Crossover dialogues with the Vision and Mission Task Force to ensure that the vision and mission encompassed perspectives on equity in hiring, retention and curriculum
- Consultations with labour organizations at OCAD U
- Consultations with Senate and the Board of Governors
- Secondary source research by ODESI and Human Resources to develop an understanding of best practices at other universities
- Legal advice to ensure compliance with the **Ontario Human Rights Code**
- Collaborative development of recommendations through the comprehensive committee membership

The task force mandate did not include a review of curriculum. However, its analysis and findings indicate that institutions with inclusive and equitable working environments make better decisions and enable a wide diversity of expression and opinion, which will inevitably broaden curriculum.

Task Force Consultation Data

FACULTY AND ACADEMIC LEADERSHIP

103 individuals participated in the faculty and academic leadership on-line consultation, of whom 18% identified as racialized or Indigenous. (Another 14% chose not to answer this question, the reasons for which may be manifold.)*

Racialized persons comprise 13% of OCAD U's faculty (2011 OCAD U workforce survey). Considering that more than 50% of OCADU's undergraduate students identify as belonging to an ethno-racial group other than "white," (2011 NSSE survey), our faculty and academic leadership have fallen far short of mirroring our student population.

We had an equal number of male and female participants. The majority of the participants (35%), however, were in the 50-59 age group, which reflects their experience, but also the aging of our faculty and upper administration. We had fairly good representation from all the faculties: Faculty of Art, 35%; Faculty of Design, 36% Faculty of Liberal Arts & Sciences, 23%.* We also had good representation across all the labour categories. Responses were received from sessional, CLTA, Tenured, and Tenure-track faculty. Most of the respondents (73%), however, were not in a leadership position (as Graduate Program Director, etc.), suggesting that this was largely faculty responding to the online consultation.

*Although the total number of participants was 104, many chose not to answer all the questions. Participants could "skip" certain questions, or simply mark "I choose not to answer."

UNIVERSITY STAFF AND NON-ACADEMIC LEADERSHIP

While a larger number of non-academic staff responded to the on-line consultation (131 participants), this also included a larger number of participants who chose not to answer all the questions. The staff consultations indicate, however, that a larger percentage of the participants identify as racialized or Indigenous (30%) than was the case with the faculty/ leadership online consultation. This larger cohort also includes a larger number of women (61%). The age is also considerably younger for this part of the on-line consultation, with the largest percentage (36%) being in the 30-39-year-old group. The various labour categories were not as well represented in this part of the consultation, as an overwhelming majority (45%) worked as administrative staff or librarians. Responses were received, however, from managers, technicians, counsellors, teaching assistants, models, and others, in far fewer numbers. As was the case with the faculty on-line consultation, the majority of participants (64%) did not work in a leadership position.

The task force did not undertake a quantitative survey to identify workforce representation of Indigenous and racialized staff and faculty and measure progress from the 2011 baseline, although data collection is part of its recommendations.

Responses from On-Line Consultations, Open Houses, and Informal Meetings

Feedback from community members noted a range of examples of systemic racism and bias in hiring and employment practices and decisions, and its impacts on retention and advancement. A summary is below:

BARRIERS TO THE RECRUITMENT OF INDIGENOUS AND RACIALIZED FACULTY AND STAFF

- The composition of hiring committees was repeatedly raised as a barrier to recruitment, due to the lack of diversity of committees, and use of informal and biased hiring practices and selection criteria that disadvantage racialized and Indigenous candidates
- Hiring from within existing informal communities or “who you know” was often raised as a factor in why faculty composition repeats itself
- Informal practice and criteria of hiring for “culture fit” operates as a proxy for discriminatory biases
- It was also suggested that job ads should state explicitly that OCAD U is looking specifically for racialized and Indigenous applicants.
- Lived experience, and community-based work experience need to be recognized as a part of skills and qualifications, in addition to terminal degrees.
- There was a perceived lack of international reach and under-use of non-traditional recruitment venues in our searches
- External perception of low remuneration and extensive service commitments expected of racialized and Indigenous faculty
- Short application deadlines inhibit outreach as well as some from applying for positions.
- The lack of racialized and Indigenous faculty in upper administrative positions is a deterrent.
- Poor track record of treatment of racialized and Indigenous faculty, who are perceived as holding precarious positions.
- HR needs wider recruitment and advertisement; more funds for outreach.
- Requests were made that job ads target and undertake outreach to various communities.
- Not requesting ethnicity/race self-identification as part of interview process was seen as problematic, making it difficult to identify Indigenous and racialized candidates.

BARRIERS TO THE RETENTION OF INDIGENOUS AND RACIALIZED FACULTY AND STAFF

- Insufficient Professional Development funding; lack of information regarding funding opportunities for advancement.
- Insufficient time to dedicate to career development due to service commitments and heavy workloads.
- Differential treatment, lack of support for faculty equity initiatives.
- There appears to be no systematic method for the awarding of course releases.
- Silo-ing of Faculties and lack of potential for cross-program or cross-Faculty collaboration and discussion to diminish sense of isolation.
- Lack of mentorship.
- Lack of information; poor communication.
- Inadequate training for managers to address issues of racism.
- Lack of community-building and networking opportunities.
- Over reliance and over-work of limited pool of racialized and Indigenous individuals, due to the need for 'diversity' representation on committees and in governance.
- Performance reviews not completed consistently.
- Perception that racialized individuals were over-represented in contract positions with no potential to advance into secure employment.
- Survey respondents noted the need for more permanent jobs, developments plans and goals, and salaries that match.

BARRIERS TO LEADERSHIP OPPORTUNITIES FOR FACULTY AND STAFF

- Not enough diversity in existing leadership positions, perception that racialized and Indigenous candidates are not welcomed in these roles.
- Already heavy workload for faculty and staff makes it challenging to undertake additional advancement.
- Inadequate Professional development and mentorship to prepare individuals for advancement.

OCAD University Equity Statement

OCAD University acknowledges that a commitment to the principles of equity requires an engagement with and response to the complex, systemic, and often deeply imbedded ways that systems and practices exclude disproportionately underrepresented communities. Such groups include, but are not limited to, Indigenous Peoples, women, racialized peoples, persons with disabilities, and lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer, and intersex and 2-spirit persons. OCAD University thus aims to advance the principles of equity by prioritizing the equitable allocation of resources across the institution and by creating a positive and inclusive environment for all of the university's communities and constituencies.

As an institution committed to art, design, digital media and related scholarship, OCAD University recognizes the profound and essential value that diversity brings to the creation, reception and circulation of creative practices and discourse. OCAD University understands that valuing diverse creative practices and forms of knowledge are essential to, and enrich, the institution's core mission and vision.

The institution understands that the advancing of equity extends beyond the numerical representation of underrepresented communities, or the inclusion of underrepresented groups in order to achieve diversity. Rather, a more engaged approach to equity requires the implementation

and evaluation of specific measures or policies that recognize, address, and remediate the exclusion of underrepresented groups from the institutions of higher learning specifically, and from the larger art & design sector generally. For students, this includes the creation of opportunities for underrepresented students to participate in educational programs that can close gaps in their success and achievement. For employees, this includes the creation and implementation of policies that enable historically underrepresented faculty and staff to have equal access to employment, professional growth opportunities, and institutional resources. For the Board of Governors equitable representation ensures that diverse viewpoints and fair practices will be part of university governance.

OCAD University encourages the equitable representation, participation, and leadership of underrepresented communities in the design, implementation and evaluation of faculties and programs within and across the institution. Pursuing equity in all aspects of teaching, research, and community engagement, the institution sustains a range of knowledge forms, genres and practices, including those produced by equity seeking communities.

University Action Plan

THE TASK FORCE HAS UNDERTAKEN TO COMBINE ITS RECOMMENDATIONS WITH AN ACTION PLAN THAT INCLUDES NEAR-TERM (UP TO 5 YEARS) GOALS AND LONGER-TERM (UP TO 10 YEARS GOALS).

1. OCAD U will implement the following special program¹ under section 14 of the **Ontario Human Rights Code** in all forthcoming competitions for tenured faculty, academic administrator, manager, librarians, and administrative & confidential staff positions: “In order to alleviate the under-representation of racialized and Indigenous tenured faculty and academic administrators [or managers, librarians, administrative & confidential staff], priority in hiring will be given to qualified racialized and Indigenous persons who self-identify as such in the application process. This initiative is a special program under the **Ontario Human Rights Code**”. OCAD U can further specify that only Indigenous or racialized applicants may apply in competitions to increase the representation of these groups as a special program. The Office of Diversity, Equity & Sustainability Initiatives will continue to advise on areas of under-representation requiring special programs.
2. In the short term (within 5 years) we recommend that a robust system for data collection and analysis of workforce and student population data be established. The workforce data collection system should capture recruitment, hiring, promotion and retention data, and have the functionality to compare workforce representation to census data, as well as student representation, by program and/or department.
 - a) Data should be jointly monitored by ODESI with Human Resources (employee data) and the office of the Vice-Provost, Students & International (student data).
 - b) OCAD U should undertake a campus-wide survey within the next year to collect updated workforce data that can be compared to the 2011 workforce demographics.
 - c) Deans and administrative managers will be responsible for setting numerical targets for their respective programs/ departments. Support for setting short-term goals will be provided by ODESI and Human Resources.

¹Section 14 of the **Human Rights Code** allows organizations to create temporary special measures on a voluntary basis to help create opportunities for people who experience discrimination, economic hardship and disadvantage. The OHRC encourages the development of special programs as an effective way to help reduce discrimination and address historical disadvantage. Examples of special programs include: programs designed to promote the hiring and advancement of underrepresented communities and programs designed to encourage the enrolment of Indigenous students in a university. Special programs must be developed carefully and with clear reasons about why a particular group is chosen for special assistance. See the OHRC’s *Special programs and the Ontario Human Rights Code – A self-help guide (2010)*.

3. In the long term (up to 10 years), we recommend that our faculty and staff complement be reflective of our student population.
4. To support employment equity institution-wide, we recommend that the Faculties and administrative managers create departmental employment equity plans, a process by which progress will be evaluated annually and reported to EEEEC.
 - a) Data and progress including non-numerical terms (training) will be considered, culminating with a report to the community.
5. We recommend that an Employment Equity administrator be hired to implement employment equity initiatives, including:
 - a) Developing relevant policy and procedures
 - b) Coordinating/facilitating training
 - c) Analyzing and reporting on applicant tracking and workforce representation data
 - d) Advising academic and administrative managers and hiring committee chairs on employment equity measures
6. We recommend that a trained group of faculty and staff be established who will serve as employment equity representatives on all hiring committees, peer review committees (faculty), and performance review/job evaluation (admin) committees.
 - a) The group would receive training in equitable practices in hiring, and in preventing and addressing individual, institutional and systemic racism. This training is also to be completed by all academic and administrative managers, Chairs, Graduate Program Directors, and Human Resources staff.
7. We recommend that all job postings, and the OCAD U web page, reflect institutional equity commitments and institutional Special Programs in hiring under section 14 of **the Code**. In addition, equity needs to be embedded throughout job postings and reflected in qualifications, experiences etc.
 - a) We also recommend that job postings be approved by the aforementioned Employment Equity administrator prior to posting, and posted in wider arenas.
 - b) Prioritization of equity seeking groups in recruitment efforts should be highlighted in outreach strategies and in the ads.
8. We recommend that a process of digital applicant tracking be implemented to track applicant pool diversity, and that this data be used for barrier identification and removal at each stage of the recruitment and selection process.
9. We recommend that those participating in employee recruitment and selection on behalf of OCAD U must receive training with respect to best practices in equitable hiring, university policy and the law as it relates to recruitment and selection.
 - a) As necessary, outside members should be added to hiring committees to ensure appropriate expertise.

- 10.** We recommend that qualified racialized and/or Indigenous candidates be a part of all short lists.
- a)** To further enable this, we recommend broadening shortlists to 5 or 6 applicants.
 - b)** To ensure that shortlists are diverse, we recommend that the VPA's office and/or hiring managers be given the wherewithal to return shortlists to the relevant hiring committee if the shortlists do not meet the prioritization criteria
- 11.** We recommend that an Indigenous Services Administrator be appointed with permanent funding established from not just various levels of government, but also from OCAD U.
- a)** We are aware that the proposed Academic Plan is putting forward the creation of a position to address this and we support that proposition.
- 12.** We recommend the creation of a permanent faculty/staff lounge, which would serve multiple purposes: It would give faculty and staff a place to meet informally and create spaces of community, collaboration and new knowledge. It could be used for various social events. But it could also house rotating services for faculty and staff, such as health and wellness support, accommodation information.
- a)** We are aware that this initiative is already being considered as part of the Creative City Campus renovations and support this plan, as well as recommending the creation of an interim space.
- 13.** We recommend that a more formalized mentorship process be implemented.
- a)** Recognizing the disproportionate amount of mentoring called on from existing racialized and Indigenous faculty, we recommend that mentorship work be recognized in terms of service for faculty and a parallel mechanism implemented for administrative staff.
 - b)** There also needs to be less precarity to ensure stronger mentorship
- 14.** We recommend and encourage management and labour to work together to realize appropriate changes to collective agreements to realize these recommendations.

Conclusion

As we move forward with implementing these recommendations, we would like to borrow a phrase from Sara Ahmed's influential, *On Being Included: Racism and Diversity in Institutional Life*: "What does diversity do?" ("Introduction"). To this we would like to add, "What can these recommendations do?" It was very important to the members of the task force that we create not just another policy document, but a set of recommendations with measurable outcomes, in other words, an action plan. To this end, the recommendations have many built-in measures and responses. We want to not only increase racialized and Indigenous faculty and staff, but to have the relevant data to judge whether we are meeting our goals. As such, steps are already in place to conduct a demographic survey of our students, faculty, and staff to ensure faculty/staff and students are a reflection of each other. We want not only to have another equity statement, but for this to be an active process. As such, we are proposing that all Faculties and administrative departments draft area-specific employment equity plans, where progress will be evaluated on a yearly basis and monitored by the OCAD University Employment and Educational Equity Committee, an advisory committee to the President. Other initiatives, such as the faculty/staff lounge or the appointment of an Indigenous Services administrator, are underway.

Ahmed's response to the above-mentioned question is, in part, as follows: "The question of what diversity does is also, then, a question of where diversity goes (and where it does not) as well as in whom and in what diversity is deposited (as well as in whom or in what it is not)" ("Introduction"). The question of

diversity and equity at OCAD University, then, is, in part, where this document and the recommendations therein "go." The members of the task force are well aware that it is important that this report not languish on the shelf alongside other documents. Diversity and equity must be embedded in all levels of the institution: from administrative practices, to staff hiring, to the Faculties, to the curriculum that is delivered to the students that attend the school, to the research priorities that are set. The new Academic Plan entitled OCAD University: A Transformative Student Experience places Truth and Reconciliation and diversity and equity high on its agenda. As both the academic plan and this document attest, diversity and equity are not problems for diverse faculty/staff members alone, but for the institution as a whole. It is important that we, as an institution, acknowledge where we have created or enabled barriers to exist, which limited the hiring, retention, and advancement of racialized and Indigenous faculty and staff. We must do the hard work to remove those barriers.

Our mandate was to increase the percentage of racialized and indigenous employees in all areas and at all levels of the university through hiring and retention measures. This can only occur by our long-term goal of 2027 if diversity "goes" (to use Ahmed's phrase) to all areas of the university and becomes a cornerstone of how OCAD University defines itself. Our success will lead to an institution that truly embodies, advocates for and celebrates the complex and diverse cultures of our century. It is our aim that this report be one of the building blocks in that transformation.

Works Cited

Ahmed, Sara. *On Being Included: Racism and Diversity in Institutional Life*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012.

Henry, Frances, E. Dua, C. James, A. Kobayashi, P. Li, H. Ramos, M. Smith, Eds. *The Equity Myth: Racialization and Indigeneity at Canadian Universities*. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 2017. (forthcoming)

Phillips, Katherine K. *Better Decisions Through Diversity*. KelloggInsight. Kellogg School of Management at Northwestern University, 2010. https://insight.kellogg.northwestern.edu/article/better_decisions_through_diversity

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada: Calls to Action. Winnipeg, MB: Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, 2015.