



## FINAL ASSESSMENT REPORT

Material Art & Design, Faculty of Design

<b>Prepared by:</b>	Senate Quality Assurance Committee
<b>Period of Cyclical Review:</b>	Sept. 14, 2017 – Oct. 4, 2019
<b>Dean, Faculty of Design:</b>	Dr. Elizabeth (Dori) Tunstall
<b>Program Review Team Lead:</b>	Dorie Millerson, Associate Professor, Chair, Material Art & Design
<b>External Reviewers:</b>	Paul Robert, Chair, School of Craft & Emerging Media, Alberta University of the Arts  Melanie Printup Hope, Associate Professor, Graphic Design, OCAD University

### 1. Executive Summary of Cyclical Program Review:

The Material Art & Design (MAAD) program consists of studio-based learning in the major areas of jewellery/metalsmithing and textiles with a minor area in ceramics leading towards either a BDes or BFA degree. The initial groundwork and planning for the cyclical review of the MAAD program began in 2016 with the establishment of an official review team led by the program Chair with one faculty member and one program assistant in September 2017. The process began with research and data collection for a self-study by the program team with contributions made by faculty colleagues and reports provided by administrators in curricular and institutional data collection.

In 2016, 15 faculty members, technicians and class assistants attended a workshop facilitated by the Faculty Curriculum Development Centre (FCDC) to develop Program Learning Outcomes (PLO) in relation to Degree Learning Expectations. The PLOs were then linked to program courses via results from an online survey sent to approximately 26 faculty and used to create a Curriculum Map (2017-2019). 11 faculty members and technicians attended a workshop to determine a “Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Challenges” (SWOC) analysis (February 2018); and faculty and technicians provided the team with updated feedback throughout the process via regular meetings (2018-2019). A

series of quantitative and qualitative research methods were used to collect the perspectives of students and alumni of the program. Online surveys were conducted with current students (67 participants) and alumni (33 participants) in March 2018. Quality indicators from The Strategic National Arts Alumni Project (SNAAP) survey of recent graduates from arts institutions (2015) and the National Survey of Student Engagement (NSSE) survey of first-year and senior students (2014) were consulted where MAAD program data was available. One focus group of jewellery and textiles students (12 participants) and a second focus group of minor and elective students studying in ceramics (7 participants) took place in March 2018.

The data was initially analysed by the team in July 2018 and then, after a delay due to team members' leaves and additional workload for the team lead, it was updated in August 2019 and submitted to the Vice-President, Academic and Provost's Office for review in September 2019. Two external faculty reviewers (one from OCAD U and another from a similar craft-based program in a Canadian institution) were invited to read the report and conduct a site visit on October 3-4, 2019. During their visit, the reviewers spoke with the program team, faculty, technicians, students, upper administration, toured the ceramics, jewellery, and textiles studios and observed classes in all three areas. Their External Review Report was received by the program review team on November 14, 2019 and an Internal Response was prepared by the team and submitted to the Vice-President, Academic and Provost's Office on March 12, 2020.

## **2. Strengths and Challenges:**

### **Strengths**

Strengths identified by the reviewers included a close alignment between the structure, culture and teaching environment of the MAAD program with the guiding principles of OCAD University's Academic Plan including: promotion of decolonization through cultural competency training for faculty and inviting Indigenous artists and speakers; showing respect for diversity and equity by teaching a range of global perspectives/practices and encouraging students to express and research their own heritages/identities; ethical approaches to sustainability in practice; valuing faculty in a tight-knit and supportive environment, encouraging interdisciplinarity within and outside MAAD studios; and promoting health and wellness within a positive, safe and inclusive community who work closely together in the studios.

The reviewers stated that the MAAD admission requirements are appropriately considered for the program, the Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs) were consistent with OCAD U's Undergraduate Degree-Level Expectations, and that the MAAD learning outcomes by year level were clearly connected to the curriculum map and aligned with accreditation standards. The reviewers commented on the relevance and progressive staging of the MAAD curriculum that "offers an innovative mixture of craft and technology. Each new course

complements the last and revises or offers new learning outcomes" providing "program pathways and the delivery methods in the studio [which] are very much geared to eliciting the program learning outcomes." The self-study and review also highlighted the initiatives undertaken by faculty and technicians to enhance the quality of the program and studio environment by inviting speakers, holding workshops and conducting projects with outside partners. The reviewers praised the high quality of student work as observed in their visit and as seen in the work of distinguished alumni of the program many of whom have gone on to create their own studio practices, businesses, or enrol in further education.

The faculty members were described by the reviewers as "very supportive and respectful to each other" as well as "experts in their professions and [collaborative] in research projects." The reviewers stated that the "Faculty are highly qualified to deliver the program" listing their range of higher education qualifications along with their "accomplished practices in exhibition, entrepreneurship, and industry" as evidence. The quality of teaching faculty was found to be excellent with the reviewers noting that teaching demonstrations observed during their site visit showed "exemplary competence and clarity, with a strong emphasis on safety throughout." This finding was supported by the student survey which stated that 89.4% of students "strongly agree or agree that the quality of teaching by faculty is high."

Noted in the self-study is the strength of the three studio technicians who provide an outstanding level of technical support while managing complex making environments. The importance of technical support is also acknowledged in the student survey, where 92.4% of students "strongly agree or agree that Technicians provide useful consultation and guidance in studios and shops." The reviewers commented on the inclusive nature of the MAAD studios with particular mention of the importance of the ceramics area which was echoed by students who described the studio as "a positive environment with a good sense of community for people from different majors to meet and work together."

## **Challenges**

Challenges included the high amount of teaching by sessional faculty in the program; the need for communication with other Faculties in the university; limited time and space available for studio demonstrations; the need for additional supervised and flexible hours of access to studios; the need for more space for studio equipment; and the availability of graduate employment.

While the reviewers noted a disproportionate number of sessional faculty teaching the MAAD curriculum at 54.4% of the total full time equivalent (FTE) in 2017-18, updated data on "Program Faculty FTEs by Appointment" confirms that this number has increased to 65.9% in 2019-20. Sessional faculty taught 58 out of 92 MAAD courses or 63.4% of courses offered in 2019-20. Due to the high numbers of sessional appointments, only a small number of faculty have service commitments to support the program with course leadership and committee participation. As recommended in the reports, there is also an ongoing need for teacher training and professional development in areas such as cultural competency and

gender sensitivity which may not be attended by sessional faculty if offered in an unpaid capacity. While sessional faculty are highly valued and depended upon for their specialized expertise, the precarity of this work can make it difficult to hire and retain them.

Groundwork towards the Academic Plan's principle of decolonization and priority on Indigenous learning has included faculty workshops on cultural competency, a MAAD-specific Wholistic Approach to Curriculum workshop held by Nadia McLaren (Educational Developer, Indigenous Learning) in August 2019, and invited in-class talks and workshops by Indigenous artists and designers. While this work should continue, consultation with and hiring Indigenous faculty is paramount to advancing decolonization and should be part of curricular development and future hiring plans.

The ability for MAAD students to take courses in both jewellery and textiles or specialize in one area was seen by the reviewers to be more complex than in some equivalent programs. The reviewers outlined the importance of continuing to offer the option to focus or specialize in one area to prepare students for the professional field. The value of fourth-year learning in which students develop their own body of work in the thesis courses was commended but students' concerns were raised over the team-taught nature of critique assessment over being graded by one faculty member. The need for communication between MAAD and other Faculties of Art, Liberal Studies and Graduate Studies was stated in order to, for example, create access for MAAD students to other facilities (such as photo studios); create a dialogue with liberal studies faculty teaching craft history and theory; and establish more clarity in methods of access for graduate students to the studios.

The importance of studio demonstrations in the curriculum outlined a number of challenges including the short allotment of time for classes (typically three-hours in length that may be used to focus on demonstrations over work periods) which was seen by the reviewers to contribute to pressure on technicians to re-teach outside of class. The need for time spent in the studios was discussed in connection to program completion rates alongside challenges students face with commuting, working, and other circumstances. Difficulties faced by faculty and students due to the limited size, noise, small scale of work, and layout of the studios during demonstrations were outlined. As a teaching tool and resource, the reviewers recommend the development of subtitled technical demonstration videos on Canvas that would provide the opportunity for students to review and translate instructions, and potentially alleviate some of the demands placed on technicians outside of class time.

With increasing enrollment, providing additional supervised and flexible hours of access to the studios and tools was seen as paramount to enable students to complete their work and reduce frustration. The reviewers paired the costs of additional technician, class assistant and/or monitor hours with the savings that would be made in higher completion rates. The student demand for increased courses in ceramics also cannot be met without increased technical supervisory hours made available. Related to enrollment and retention is the need for studio-specific language support for the high numbers of international and ELL students accepted into the program. Faculty have requested tools for translation and ELL strategies

in their teaching while technicians have expressed the importance of communicating health and safety practices.

The need for more space for studio equipment to be set up for student use was also seen as vital. Specific items of equipment are not accessible to students as there is no space to set them up for continued use. Allocating adjacent non-MAAD faculty offices to the MAAD program would immediately provide modest additions to the studio spaces allowing students to access specialized equipment close to the studios and reduce redundancies in the technician's tasks. Noted in the self-study are the cramped conditions of the three MAAD faculty offices where between five to seven faculty share a room made for two and the lack of dedicated space for textiles thesis students. The need for ventilation to be evenly distributed across the studios was strongly stated with adding ventilation to the jewellery thesis studio seen as a priority. Increasing the number of ventilation solutions currently used in the textiles studio to other areas of textiles and jewellery would allow more students to work on different processes safely at the same time.

Although many MAAD alumni go on to study in highly regarded post-graduate programs, create their own businesses, and become respected professionals in craft disciplines, employment may take some time to find after graduation. While new MAAD graduates find employment within four months on par with SNAAP averages, few respondents stated that their jobs at that point were related to their training. This may be due in part to the entrepreneurial nature of craft practice, and the additional time needed to establish a business, find related employment or finish studies. While the alumni surveyed (graduates from 2002-2017) stated that the program had not helped them master the skills of professional practice, it is important to note that 54.5% of those participants stated that at least one of their current occupations is related to their studies in the MAAD program. Those alumni who are not working in related fields cited unavailability of work in the field, financial difficulties of working in the field, and/or starting their own practice as the primary reasons why.

While alumni commented on the need for increased training in digital technology and professional practice, it is important to note that initial steps have already been taken to address these concerns with a course introducing 2D and 3D digital technology in first-year and two professional practice courses with a focus on career planning and related skills in third-year (one for jewellery and one for textiles) developed in response to student and alumni feedback and offered from 2018-2019 onwards. Opportunities developed with the Centre for Emerging Artists and Designers (CEAD) such as career launchers and work placements also help to address this concern. The review highlights that many of the professional practice skills already embedded in course content (such as material sourcing, pricing, marketing, displaying work and budgeting) should be more clearly articulated as learning outcomes. Also noted was the need for increased academic advising to help recommend courses or pathways related to students' career interests.

### 3. Implementation Plan:

Recommendation	Proposed Follow-up	Responsibility and Other Stakeholders	Implementation Date/Timeline
<b>Quality of educational experience</b>  Hire additional class assistants and add more hours to open studios, especially on weekends.	Increase supervisory hours allocated to the MAAD studios where possible depending on budgetary considerations and the number of registered students in MAAD courses.	<b>Responsibility:</b> Dean of the Faculty of Design, Director, Facilities and Studio Services; Studio Management  <b>Stakeholders:</b> Studio Technicians; Program Chair; Class Assistants; Students	To be determined and in relation to Flow curricular changes to be implemented in 2023-2024 (which include increased class sizes and fewer program requirements).
<b>Physical resource requirements</b>  Make improvements to the ventilation and temperature controls in jewellery and textiles studios.	To be discussed in relation to capital work projects for the 100 McCaul campus.	<b>Responsibility:</b> Dean of the Faculty of Design, Director, Facilities and Studio Services; Studio Management  <b>Stakeholders:</b> Studio Technicians; Program Chair; Summer Faculty; Students where applicable	Proposed for Summer 2020-2021 capital works.
<b>Admissions, recruitment and retention</b>  Review English language requirements for admission to the program (university-wide).	Program Chair to consult with Admissions & Recruitment to discuss these recommendations and parameters around entry into the MAAD program. Possible synergies may exist with current development of a summer language program at OCAD U.	<b>Responsibility:</b> Manager, Undergraduate Admissions & Recruitment  <b>Stakeholders:</b> Program Chair	Consult fall 2020 regarding applications for fall 2021.
<b>Physical resource requirements</b>  Provide additional spaces to accommodate studio equipment currently in storage to be accessible and close to teaching areas.	Prepare a multi-year proposal to negotiate an increase in MAAD space to better meet current needs and plan for the goals of Flow, which includes larger class sizes.  Proposal to include: allocating out-of-program faculty offices in Jewellery hallway to the MAAD; assessing the need for increased tools/equipment and studio reconfiguration; finding a location for senior/thesis	<b>Responsibility:</b> Dean of the Faculty of Design and Program Chair to develop initial proposal with input from Studio Technicians and Studio Management.  <b>Stakeholders:</b> Studio Technicians; Program Chair; Studio Management, Faculty and Students as applicable.	Initial proposal to meet current needs to be developed in Spring 2020 and presented to Decanal team and the Provost.  Planning to meet Flow targets to be developed in stages between 2020-2023.  Flow curricular changes to take place in MAAD, 2023-2024.

	students working in textiles; and allocating additional out-of-program offices as MAAD faculty offices.		
<b>Curriculum development</b>  Support the production of video tutorials of studio processes and safe handling of equipment.	The Dean will work with the faculty to prepare grants as well as solicit donors to help defray the cost of video production. If budget in place, the Dean will offer one course release for the summer development of video demonstration content.  Develop a required quiz on Canvas to ensure that registered students in studios are familiar with studio procedures and machine operation.	<b>Responsibility:</b> Dean of the Faculty of Design; Program Chair; Studio Technicians  <b>Stakeholders:</b> Studio Management; and Faculty Members as applicable.	Develop Canvas quiz in Spring 2020.  Locate funding for filming in 2020-2021.  Filming and editing proposed for Summer 2021.
<b>Human resource requirements</b>  Hire an additional permanent faculty member.	Where budget allows, it has been recognized that MAAD has high priority for at least one additional tenure-track position within the next three years. Hiring decisions will relate to Flow curricular planning and Academic Plan Principles including that of Decolonization and Diversity and Equity.	<b>Responsibility:</b> Dean of the Faculty of Design; VP Academic and Provost  <b>Stakeholders:</b> Program Chair	To be determined as budget allows within the next three years (2020 to 2023).
<b>Admissions, recruitment and retention</b>  Provide more clarity around the BDes being the default degree, and the mechanics of opting-in to the BFA for incoming students.	Work with Admissions to make sure students are aware of the options when entering program.  Continue to send out notices at the beginning of each academic year from Chair.  Inform faculty of the process so that they can direct the students where needed.	<b>Responsibility:</b> Manager, Undergraduate Admissions & Recruitment; Program Chair.  <b>Stakeholders:</b> Student Advising; Faculty Members; and Students.	Fall 2020 and ongoing.
<b>Quality of educational experience</b>  Increase communication across programs.	Program Chair to discuss curricular/access needs for following academic year with the Faculty of Design office (e.g. photography).  Program Chair to meet with Associate Dean and/or faculty of	<b>Responsibility:</b> Program Chair; Faculty of Design Office; Associate Dean of FoLASSIS  <b>Stakeholders:</b> Faculty Members and Students as applicable.	Spring/Summer 2020 for 2020-2021 year.

	FoLASSIS to discuss the content, workload, and learning outcomes of liberal studies offerings required in the MAAD program in relation to the PLOs and other courses in MAAD.		
<b>Curriculum development</b>  Final grade in Thesis classes be assigned by primary supervisor, in consultation with other supervisors.	Thesis faculty to discuss this concern and feasibility of longer critiques to encourage more interaction with the team.	<b>Responsibility:</b> Program Chair; Thesis Faculty Members.	Spring/Summer 2020.  Continue thesis course development in relation to the implementation of Flow curriculum.
<b>Quality of educational experience</b>  Create fair processes for dealing with out-of-program students and faculty who drop in to studios requesting access, use of equipment and instruction.	Creating handout/signage for out-of-program student and faculty requests, to explain how access can be requested; that notice is needed to arrange training; and the limitations of what can be offered.  Increase communication with Graduate Studies and Studio Management about the timing and development of workshops, use of resources and access by graduate students.	<b>Responsibility:</b> Program Chair; Studio Technicians; Studio Management; Dean of the Faculty of Design; Graduate Studies Directors.  <b>Stakeholders:</b> Faculty Members and Students as applicable.	Spring/Summer 2020 and ongoing communication.

**Additional recommendations to be implemented, not included in the external review report**

<b>Curriculum development</b>  Focus on experiential learning and professional practice should be increased.	Articulate and assess how professional practice is learned by year level in many courses (relate course learning outcomes to program learning outcomes).  Investigate the integration of an internship/placement into the MAAD curriculum.  Monitor and continue development of third-year professional practice courses with feedback from students and alumni.	<b>Responsibility:</b> Program Chair; MAAD Curriculum Committee  <b>Stakeholders:</b> Centre for Emerging Artists and Designers (CEAD) Staff	Initial discussions in curricular meetings in Spring and Fall 2020 and ongoing.
<b>Curriculum development</b>  Continue to address high workload in courses.	Increase communication between faculty members to share knowledge of each other's courses in order to balance weights	<b>Responsibility:</b> Program Chair; MAAD Curriculum Committee  <b>Stakeholders:</b>	Initial discussions in curricular meetings in Spring and Fall 2020 and in ongoing faculty meetings.

	of assignments, stagger deadlines, ensure consistent delivery, and evaluate assessments in alignment with the PLOs.	Faculty Members	
<b>Curriculum development</b>  Areas for future curricular development	<p>Develop and offer additional ceramics courses with increased technical support.</p> <p>Integrate wholistic and Indigenous approaches to the curriculum through professional development for faculty with the support of the FCDC, and in the consultation with and hiring of Indigenous faculty.</p> <p>Articulate and monitor digital technology learning and needs through the year levels and seek feedback from students and alumni.</p> <p>Continue to propose a wearables stream to build on our strengths in craft and concept development in collaboration with other areas of the university.</p>	<p><b>Responsibility:</b> Program Chair; MAAD Curriculum Committee; Faculty &amp; Curriculum Development Centre (FCDC) Staff</p> <p><b>Stakeholders:</b> Faculty Members and Administrators as applicable.</p>	<p>Initial discussions in curricular meetings in Fall 2020 and ongoing.</p> <p>Propose curricular changes as per the approved Flow process.</p>
<b>Faculty development</b>  Offer paid professional development to allow all MAAD faculty equal access to learning in the areas of:  Cultural and gender-related sensitivity; ELL teaching strategies; Wholistic and Indigenous approaches to the curriculum; and teaching technical demonstrations for larger class sizes.	Paid professional development is not currently financially feasible.	n/a	n/a
<b>Physical resource requirements</b>  Improve studio facilities by providing:  More benches and storage, finishing processes, soundproofing,	To be discussed in relation to Capital work projects for the 100 McCaul campus.	<p><b>Responsibility:</b> Dean of the Faculty of Design; Director, Facilities and Studio Services; Studio Management</p> <p><b>Stakeholders:</b> Studio Technicians; Program Chair; Summer</p>	Where funding is in place, to take place in the summers from 2021-2023 before the implementation of Flow in 2023-2024.

<p>and digital technology in the jewellery studio.</p> <p>Safe chemical application, soundproofing, digital technology, accessibility, and storage in the textiles studio.</p>		<p>Faculty and Students where applicable</p>	
<p><b>Quality of educational experience</b></p> <p>Increase support from Student Wellness (Centre for Students with Disabilities) to provide more direct assistance to students and faculty regarding accommodations or accessibility in the studio environment.</p>	<p>Communicate to Student Wellness the range of MAAD studio environmental factors and processes that may assist in creating accommodations specific to studio practice.</p> <p>Continue to advocate for technician involvement in the process of developing accommodations and accessibility plans for students.</p> <p>Build on FCDC Universal Design for Learning workshops as applicable.</p>	<p><b>Responsibility:</b> Program Chair; MAAD Curriculum Committee; Student Wellness</p> <p><b>Stakeholders:</b> Students; Student Accessibility Advisors; Faculty Members</p>	<p>Spring 2020 onwards.</p>
<p><b>Quality of educational experience</b></p> <p>Increase support from the Writing &amp; Learning Centre for faculty teaching ELL students and resources for ELL students.</p>	<p>Work with Writing and Learning Centre to discuss need for language support in the studio environment in terms of instruction and safe handling of materials and possible strategies for assistance.</p>	<p><b>Responsibility:</b> Program Chair; MAAD Curriculum Committee, Writing &amp; Learning Centre</p> <p><b>Stakeholders:</b> ELL Specialists; Faculty Members, Students</p>	<p>Spring 2020 onwards</p>
<p><b>Admissions, recruitment and retention</b></p> <p>Improve promotion of the program by increasing the visibility of student's work to the OCAD U community and by increasing visibility of the student, alumni and faculty work externally.</p>	<p>Improve display cases in the studio hallways and opportunities in student galleries.</p> <p>Promote the work and activities of MAAD students, faculty and alumni through social media and marketing to the public and prospective students in high school programs.</p> <p>Track alumni accomplishments and outreach to create events and find ways to support emerging graduates and establish placement opportunities.</p>	<p><b>Responsibility:</b> Program Chair; Program Faculty; Marketing and Communications; Admissions and Recruitment; Alumni Relations; CEAD; Gallery Coordinators; FCDC</p> <p><b>Stakeholders:</b> Faculty, Technicians, Students, Alumni</p>	<p>Online promotion to be determined as per capacity of each department and service of program faculty.</p> <p>Articulation agreements with other institutions as per Flow curricular change timelines.</p>

	<p>Develop closer relationships with other institutions through new articulation agreements to offer opportunities to students.</p> <p>Develop and maintain a program website.</p>		
<b>Quality of educational experience</b>  Increase academic advising for students to help navigate through the program.	<p>Create flow charts to describe pathways on website and/or Canvas pages; and train faculty advisors to meet with students and provide advice and support.</p>	<p><b>Responsibility:</b> Program Chair; MAAD Curriculum Committee; Faculty of Design Office; Student Advising</p> <p><b>Stakeholders:</b> Faculty Members, Students</p>	<p>2020 onwards for discussions of faculty-level advising.</p> <p>Academic advising will be available in 2023 as per Flow curricular change timelines.</p>

#### 4. Recommendations:

A plan for prioritizing the recommendations will be developed in consultation between the Chair of MAAD and Dean of the Faculty of Design with input from the program faculty and technicians. Smaller scale recommendations that can be acted on by faculty as part of service will be scheduled at times when faculty are available starting in the Spring of 2020. Recommendations that require consultation between the Chair and specific departments and managers will be determined by availability in the Spring and into the Fall of 2020. Larger scale recommendations that require capital investment and/or fundraising will need to be determined by the Dean in consultation with the Chair as per usual budgetary procedures and fiscal planning. Curricular changes will need to be considered in relation to the Flow process of increasing class sizes and reducing program course requirements. Measures used to evaluate progress made will vary with each recommendation.

#### 5. Conclusion:

The Senate Quality Assurance Committee (SQAC) was provided with the documents pertaining to the Material Art & Design cyclical program review, including the self-study brief; the responses of the Dean and the Vice-President, Academic and Provost; the External Review Report; and the Internal Response. In their review of the final report, the SQAC discussed program strengths and barriers including human resource and space requirements and the ways the program is embedding hybridity in curriculum delivery. The committee recommended the report to Senate for approval. The report received approval from Senate on April 27, 2020.